

22 Church Ln, Kings Worthy, SO21



Winchester
City Council

14/02256/LIS



Legend

Scale: 0 0.01 0.02 0.04 KM

Reproduced from the Ordnance Survey map with permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office © Crown Copyright 2012.

Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown Copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings.

Organisation	Winchester City Council
Department	Winchester GIS
Comments	Not Set
Date	24/11/2014
MSA Number	100019531

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

Item No: 2
Case No: 14/02256/LIS / W01929/08LB
Proposal Description: Demolition of existing single storey rear extension and outbuildings and erection of single and two storey rear extension with detached garage.(AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING) (RESUBMISSION)
Address: 22 Church Lane Kings Worthy Winchester SO23 7QS
Parish, or Ward if within Winchester City: Kings Worthy
Applicants Name: Mr & Mrs Kelly
Case Officer: Richard Whittington
Date Valid: 8 October 2014
Site Factors: Kings Worthy Conservation Area
Civil Aviation
Conservation Area
Recommendation: Application Refused

General Comments

This application is reported to Committee because of the number of letters of support received for the concurrent planning application for the same works.

This is a resubmitted application for a similar scheme that was previously withdrawn following Officer's concerns on the impact the proposal had on the Listed Building and the affect on the character of the Conservation Area.

The resubmitted proposal is reduced in height from that previously submitted and set slightly further away from the listed building.

The associated planning application for the same works is currently under consideration.

Site Description

Tudor Cottage is a grade II listed building, located in the Kings Worthy Conservation Area on the east side of Church Lane. The property is one and a half storeys. It is a semi-detached dwelling and dates from the 17th and early 19th centuries.

The property has been previously extended in the form of a single storey side and rear extension dating from the 1970's.

Two sheds and a garage form ancillary buildings on site (all to be removed). The land rises from the rear and side of the property up to the north and east.

Proposal

It is proposed to remove the 1970's single storey side and rear extension (41 sqm approx.), sheds and garage and construct a single and two storey extension to the rear connected to the house by a glazed link in contemporary design and materials. A garage and car port are also proposed of traditional design.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

The glazed link separating the cottage and extension is proposed to be approximately 6.2m in length. The single storey element proposed is to be 3.1m in height above ground level and the two storey element 4.1m above ground level with both elements cut into the ground by approximately 1m.

The existing dwelling is approximately 147sqm in floor area over two storeys. The proposed extension including the glazed link is 150sqm approximately in floor area, consisting of 115.sqm at ground floor level and 35sqm at first floor.

A 1.8m gap is retained between the proposal and the south east and north east boundaries with neighbouring properties.

The existing access is to be retained with a garage / car port proposed to be located within the site to the north of the dwelling.

Relevant Planning History

10/01479/FUL - (HOUSEHOLDER) Extension to existing driveway; relocation of retaining wall and fence line with the removal of flower bed and creation of a permeable hard standing (WITHIN THE CURTILAGE OF A LISTED BUILDING). Permitted 22nd October 2010.

13/02875/FUL - (AMENDED DESCRIPTION) (HOUSEHOLDER) Demolition of existing single storey rear extension and outbuildings and erection of single and two storey rear extension with detached garage. Withdrawn 19th March 2014.

13/02876/LIS - AMENDED DESCRIPTION Demolition of existing single storey rear extension and outbuildings and erection of single and two storey rear extension with detached garage. Withdrawn 19th March 2014.

14/02255/FUL - (HOUSEHOLDER) Demolition of existing single storey rear extension and outbuildings and erection of single and two storey rear extension with detached garage(AFFECTS THE SETTING OF A LISTED BUILDING) (RESUBMISSION). Pending consideration.

Consultations

Head of Historic Environment:

The proposal cannot be supported as it is considered harmful to the setting of the listed building by virtue of scale, height, mass, bulk and choice of materials. It does not reflect the prevalent pattern of development and is therefore considered to be extremely inappropriate in the context of this listed building and the conservation area, exacerbated by surrounding topography.

Policy HE4 requires that particular attention should be paid to conserving attractive views out of and into the area, this form of development would be incongruous both against the appearance of the conservation area and the setting of the listed building.

The proposal would take up the entire rear part of the garden and be equivalent in length to the Listed Building, tantamount to attaching a large three storey house by an extremely long glazed link and dug down into the garden as if it were a partial subterranean bunker.

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

The design will dominate the small scale of the thatched listed cottage. The long length of the link corridor will in effect isolate the main cottage from the extension – it is noted that the existing living room will become a large entrance Hall rendering the living space to circulation space only

Representations:

Kings Worthy Parish Council

- 'The Parish Council wish to object to the application on the grounds that it is not in keeping with a listed building nor the surrounding conservation area.'

4 letters received objecting to the application for the following reasons:

- The extension is inappropriate in relation to the listed building and conservation area.
- The extension is tantamount to a new build separate dwelling.
- The modern materials and design are incongruous
- The proposal will dominate the listed building.
- The proposal will be highly visible.

2 letters of support received.

- The proposed extension will enhance the listed building.
- The design is sympathetic
- The removal of the existing extension will better reveal the historic building.
- The use of glass walkway and the distinction between old and new is positive.

Relevant Planning Policy:

Winchester District Local Plan Review

HE4, HE5, HE14

Winchester Local Plan Part 1 – Joint Core Strategy

CP20

National Planning Policy Guidance/Statements:

National Planning Policy Framework

Supplementary Planning Guidance

Kings Worthy and Abbots Worthy Village Design Statement.

Planning Considerations

Principle of development

The principle of extending and making alterations to listed buildings is acceptable, subject to careful consideration of the impact of the proposals on the special character of the listed building; whether they will conserve and enhance the character of the Conservation Area, to accord with policies HE4, HE5, HE14 of the Winchester District Local Plan Review and CP20 of the Winchester Local Plan Part 1 – Joint Core Strategy.

The dwelling is a grade II Listed Building located within the Conservation Area. The proposals are considered to have a harmful impact on the Listed Building and Conservation Area, contrary to both local and national policy. Therefore, the proposal does not accord with policies HE4, HE5 and HE14 of Winchester District Local Plan

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

Review 2006 or policy CP20 of Winchester Local Plan Part 1 – Joint Core Strategy.

Impact of the proposals on the Listed Building and Conservation Area.

The existing dwelling is a modest thatched cottage of 1.5 storeys finished in white with many original features and a single storey side and rear extension circa 1970s. The design of the proposal is of stark contrast to the existing dwelling, being of strong contemporary form, appearance, and materials, and is large in scale separated from the dwelling by glazed link.

Whilst the juxtaposition of a contemporary design adjoining a historic building is a well established approach that can be successful to both the historic building and contemporary proposal, in this case the size and scale of the proposed extension in conjunction with the striking contemporary form is considered to be harmful to the setting of the listed building and conservation area. The proposal cannot be said to relate to or enhance the context of the historic building or conservation area.

The proposed rear extension will be clearly visible from Church Lane when approaching from the north through the entrance to the site. Although the extension is to be set down into the ground, the amount of built form visible is exacerbated by the rise in level to the rear of the property.

The size and scale of the proposed extension is considered to dominate the listed building and to be detrimental to the character of the conservation area.

Whilst the removal of the 1970's extension and various outbuildings on site will be to the benefit of the listed building, the benefit does not overcome the harm on the setting of the listed building and conservation area that the proposed extension would cause.

Conclusion

The proposed extension is considered harmful to the setting of the Listed Building and Conservation Area due the scale, height, mass, bulk and choice of materials.

Recommendation

Application Refused

1 The proposed extension is considered harmful to the setting of the listed building by reason of design, size and choice of materials, contrary to Policy HE14 of the WDLPR2006 and CP20 of the LPP1.

2 The proposals are harmful to the setting, character and appearance of the conservation area, contrary to Policies HE4 and HE5 of the WDLPR 2006.

Informatives:

In accordance with paragraphs 186 and 187 of the NPPF Winchester City Council (WCC) take a positive and proactive approach to development proposals focused on solutions. WCC work with applicants/agents in a positive and proactive manner by;

WINCHESTER CITY COUNCIL
PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

- offering a pre-application advice service and,
- updating applicants/agents of any issues that may arise in the processing of their application and where possible suggesting solutions.

In this instance the applicant was provided with pre-application advice.

2. The Local Planning Authority has taken account of the following development plan policies and proposals:-

Local Plan Part 1 - Joint Core Strategy: CP20,
Winchester District Local Plan Review 2006: HE4, HE5, HE14